

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

STEWART SMITH, Individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,	:	CIVIL ACTION
Plaintiff	:	
	:	Case No.: 2:20-CV-3583-BMS
v.	:	
	:	
DIRECT BUILDING SUPPLIES, LLC and	:	
DOES 1 through 10, inclusive, and each	:	
of them,	:	<b>DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL</b>
Defendants	:	

**DEFENDANT, DIRECT BUILDING SUPPLIES, LLC'S  
MOTION TO DISMISS AND STRIKE CLASS ALLEGATIONS OF PLAINTIFF'S  
SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6), and Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(f), Defendant, Direct Building Supplies, LLC, by its attorneys Tucker Arensberg, P.C., hereby moves to dismiss and strike class allegations of Plaintiff's Second Amended Complaint and, and in support thereof, states:

1. Plaintiff, Stewart Smith ("Plaintiff"), initiated this action by filing a Complaint before this Honorable Court on July 22, 2020, alleging negligent violations of the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, ("TCPA"), and willful violations of the TCPA on behalf of himself and two putative classes of allegedly similarly situated individuals. (Doc. 1).
2. On September 17, 2020, Defendant, Direct Building Supplies ("Defendant"), filed an Uncontested Motion for Extension of Time to Respond to the Complaint. (Doc. 3).
3. On October 30, 2020, Defendant moved to dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint. (Doc. 6).
4. In response, on November 13, 2020, Plaintiff filed a Second Amended Complaint. (Doc. 8).
5. On or about November 25, 2020, Defendant moved to dismiss Plaintiff's First Second Amended Complaint. (Doc. 9).

6. On or about October 7, 2021, this Honorable Court granted Defendant's Motion to Dismiss with leave to amend. (Doc. 16).

7. On or about October 20, 2021, Plaintiff filed a Second Amended Complaint. (Doc. 19).

8. Plaintiff's alleged two putative classes, the "ATDS Class," and the "DNC Class," should be dismissed as impermissible fail-safe classes.

9. Plaintiff's Second Amended Complaint fails to plead sufficient factual allegations to overcome the particularity requirements of Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(a)(2).

10. For all of the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum of Law, which is incorporated herein by reference, Defendant hereby moves for an Order dismissing the class allegations in Plaintiff's Second Amended Complaint, with prejudice.

WHEREFORE, Defendant, Direct Building Supplies, LLC, requests this Honorable Court to dismiss Plaintiff's Second Amended Complaint, with prejudice, and strike the class allegations.

**TUCKER ARENSBERG, P.C.**

Dated: November 10, 2021

By /s/ Kevin L. Hall  
Kevin L. Hall, PA I.D. No. 311826  
Brian J. Murren, PA I.D. #324567  
2 Lemoyne Drive, Suite 200  
Lemoyne, PA 17043  
Phone: (717) 221-7951  
Fax: (717) 232-6802  
khall@tuckerlaw.com  
bmurren@tuckerlaw.com  
*Attorneys for Defendant, Direct Building Supplies, LLC*

TADMS:5602308-1 033874-189817

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Kevin L. Hall, Esquire, of the law firm of Tucker Arensberg, P.C., hereby certify that I served a true and correct copy of the foregoing document this date through the Court's Electronic Case Filing (ECF) system on the individuals as follows:

Cynthia Z. Levin, Esquire  
Todd M. Friedman, Esquire  
Thomas E. Wheeler, Esquire  
1150 First Avenue, Suite 501  
King of Prussia, PA 19406  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

**TUCKER ARENSBERG, P.C.**

Dated: November 10, 2021

By /s/ Kevin L. Hall

Kevin L. Hall, PA I.D. No. 311826  
2 Lemoyne Drive, Suite 200  
Lemoyne, PA 17043  
Phone: (717) 221-7951  
Fax: (717) 232-6802  
khall@tuckerlaw.com  
*Attorneys for Defendant, Direct Building Supplies, LLC*